Contents

Foreword ..... **xiii**

About this Guide ..... **xv**

Core Principles and the Roadmap ..... **xxi**

1 Introduction **1**

1.1 What is an alarm system? 1
1.2 Key design principles 2
1.3 Alarm system management philosophy/Company Standard 5
1.3.1 Corporate considerations 5
1.3.2 Site considerations 5
1.4 Financial considerations 7

2 Principles of alarm system design **9**

2.1 The design process 9
2.2 Where do requirements for alarms come from? 11
2.2.1 Alarms 12
2.2.2 Alerts 13
2.2.3 The difference between an alarm, an alert and a prompt 14
2.2.4 Alerts as an alternative to control by alarms 14
2.2.5 Comparison of alarms, alerts and prompts 15
2.3 Risk assessment 17
2.3.1 The need to identify and minimise risks 17
2.3.2 Risk reduction 17
2.3.3 Safety related alarms - principles 18
2.3.4 Design and engineering of safety related alarms 19
2.3.5 Proof testing 23
2.3.6 Summary 24
2.4 Generation of alarms 24
2.4.1 Types of alarms 24
2.4.2 The selection of alarm settings 27
2.5 Structuring of alarms 29
2.5.1 Prioritisation 29
2.5.2 Logical processing of alarms 32
2.6 User centred design 32
2.6.1 The role of the operator/production staff 32
2.6.2 The type of process 34
2.7 Designing for operability 39
2.7.1 Improve the management of alarm overloads 40

3 Implementing a system of alarm management **43**

3.1 Alarm systems management organisation 43
3.1.1 Steering committee 44
3.1.2 Engineering specification 44
3.1.3 Alarm management philosophy document 44
3.1.4 The alarm co-ordinator 45
3.1.5 Alarm assessments (rationalisation) 45
3.1.6 Alarm database 45
3.1.7 Alarm analysis tools 49
3.1.8 Measuring alarm metrics 49
3.1.9 Summary alarm metrics 50
3.1.10 Detailed alarm metrics 50

3.1.11 Operations reporting and feedback action 50
3.2 Fostering a culture of improvement 50
3.3 The improvement (rationalisation) process for a specific alarm system 51
3.3.1 System capability 51
3.3.2 Problem identification 51
3.3.3 Review team/philosophy document 54
3.3.4 Supporting documentation 54
3.3.5 Plant area categorisation 55
3.3.6 Unit/plant/site review 55
3.3.7 Integration 57
3.3.8 Monitor/improvement 57
3.3.9 System tuning 58
3.4 Assessment of existing alarm system status 58
3.4.1 How useful is the alarm system 59
3.4.2 Gaining the opinions of the users 60
3.4.3 Understanding the alarm system performance 60
3.4.4 Determine how well alarms are managed 60
3.5 Detailed assessment 60
3.6 Initial assessment of individual alarms 61
3.6.1 Assessment of individual alarms on an existing system 61
3.6.2 Assessment of individual alarms for a new system 62
3.6.3 'What if' questioning 63
3.7 Alarm management philosophy document 63
3.7.1 Allocation of roles and responsibilities for design of the alarm system 64
3.7.2 Identification of the alarm system users and their needs 64
3.7.3 Definition of what an alarm should be 64
3.7.4 Definition of the safety role of the alarm system 65
3.7.5 Define how any alarms are to be registered 65
3.7.6 Definitions of alarm system performance targets 65
3.7.7 Rules for prioritisation of alarms 65
3.7.8 Alarm system configuration 66
3.7.9 Checklist for designers on the information to be recorded 66
3.7.10 Dictionary of terms and abbreviations to be used in alarm messages 66
3.7.11 Guidance to sub-contractors on the design of alarms 66
3.7.12 Guidance on content and structure of alarm response definitions 67
3.7.13 Guidance on interpreting patterns of alarms 67
3.7.14 Guidance on establishing alarm equipment test frequencies 68
3.8 Training 68

4 HCI management techniques 71

4.1 Display options 71
4.1.1 Alarm annunciator panels 73
4.1.2 Alarm list displays 74
4.1.3 Graphically embedded alarm objects 75
4.2 Overviews 75
4.3 Audio/visual assistance to the graphical interface 76
4.4 Alerts 78

5 Alarm configuration 81

5.1 Field derivation of alarms 81
5.2 Alarm processing hardware 81
5.2.1 The commercial environment 81
5.2.2 Reliability issues 82
5.2.3 Functionality 83

5.2.4 Environmental requirements 83
5.3 Alarm response definition 84
5.4 Testing of alarms 85
5.4.1 Management of testing 85
5.4.2 Example test methodology 87
5.5 Suppression 87
5.5.1 Bulk suppression 87
5.5.2 Logical suppression 88
5.5.3 General suppression rules 88
5.5.4 Implementation of suppression 89
5.5.5 Authorisation and control 91

6 Performance monitoring/improvement 93

6.1 Introduction 93
6.2 Performance metrics 93
6.3 Benchmark values 95
6.3.1 Main benchmark values 96
6.3.2 Steady state usability benchmarks 96
6.3.3 Abnormal (upset) state usability benchmarks 97
6.3.4 General usability benchmarks 98
6.3.5 Summary of metrics and benchmark values 98
6.4 Key performance indicators (KPIs) 99
6.4.1 Primary KPIs 100
6.4.2 Secondary KPIs 101
6.5 Performance levels and alarm system states 102
6.5.1 Performance levels 102
6.5.2 Alarm system states 103
6.6 Validation of metrics 112

7 Buying a new alarm system 113

7.1 Investment appraisal 113
7.2 Hardware 113
7.3 Specifying alarm functionality 114
7.4 Specifying engineering 115
7.4.1 Specification of design procedures 115
7.4.2 Specification of required performance 115
7.5 Contractual implications 116
7.5.1 Allocation of activities 116
7.5.2 Scheduling of activities 116
7.5.3 Contractual tests of acceptability 116
7.6 Ensuring usability 117

Appendix 1 The costs of poor alarm performance 119

A1.1 Three Mile Island 119
A1.2 Milford Haven Refinery 119
A1.3 Channel Tunnel Fire 119
A1.4 Tosco Avon Accident 119
A1.5 Longford Gas Explosion 120
A1.6 Grangemouth Refinery Scotland 120
A1.7 First Chemical Corporation 120
A1.8 Texas City 121
A1.9 Buncefield Oil Storage Depot 121
A1.10 IChemE accident database 121
A1.11 Nuclear power incident database 121

A1.12 HSE accident analysis 121
A1.13 HSE alarm survey 122
A1.14 Abnormal Situation Management Consortium 122
A1.15 Refinery study 123

Appendix 2 Pertinent requirements 125

Appendix 3 Prioritisation methods 127

A3.1 Potential severity of consequence 127
A3.2 Time to consequence 128
A3.3 Priority distribution of alarms 129
A3.4 Prioritisation of safety related alarms 130
A3.5 Example methods for setting of priority 131
A3.5.1 Method 1 - Priority matrix evaluation 131
A3.5.2 Method 2 - Summating consequence 135
A3.5.3 Method 3 - Taking maximum consequence 137
A3.5.3 Method 4 - General alarm assessment 139

Appendix 4 Logical processing of alarms 145

A4.1 General comments 145
A4.2 Grouping 145
A4.3 Suppression 146
A4.3.1 Redundancy logic 146
A4.3.2 Eclipsing 146
A4.3.3 Out of service plant 146
A4.3.4 Operating mode 147
A4.3.5 Major event 147
A4.4 Automatic alarm load shedding 148
A4.5 Alarms from equipment under test 149

Appendix 5 Repeating and fleeting alarms 151

A5.1 Why repeating alarms occur 151
A5.2 Engineering of signals 152
A5.3 Filtering 152
A5.4 Transient suppression 153
A5.5 Deadband 153
A5.6 De-bounce timer 154
A5.7 Counter 155
A5.8 Shelving 156
A5.9 Release ('One-shot' shelving) 157
A5.10 Auto-shelving 157
A5.11 Single line annunciation 158
A5.12 Logging of repeating alarms 159
A5.13 Summary 159

Appendix 6 Alarm management in batch plants 161

A6.1 Batch plant operation 161
A6.1.1 Alarm thresholds 162
A6.1.2 Replacement of batch with semi-batch or continuous processes 162
A6.2 Operator information 163
A6.3 Alarm rates 163
A6.4 Application of alarm priorities in batch processes 165
A6.5 Design of the alarms 165
A6.6 Generation of alarms 166
A6.7 Management of alarm limits thresholds 166

A6.8 Sources of nuisance alarms 167
A6.9 Sources of alarm floods..... 167
A6.10 Getting information to remote operations 167

Appendix 7 Alarm management in geographically distributed plant..... 169

A7.1 Distributed process operation 169
A7.2 Operator workload 170
A7.3 Alarm system performance and KPIs..... 171
A7.4 Application of alarm priorities in distributed processes..... 171
A7.5 Generation of alarms..... 172
A7.6 Telemetry issues..... 174
A7.7 Getting information to remote resources 175

Appendix 8 Usefulness questionnaire..... 177

A8.1 How many alarms are useful? 178

Appendix 9 Operator questionnaire..... 181

Appendix 10 Supporting checklists 187

A10.1 Storage and management 187
A10.2 Threshold setting 187
A10.3 Checklist for a good alarm 187
A10.4 Alarm configuration information 188
A10.5 Alarm priority information..... 188
A10.6 HAZOP checklist..... 189

Appendix 11 Design of alarm list displays 191

A11.1 Alarm states..... 191
A11.2 Content of alarm entry..... 192
A11.3 Positioning of new alarms..... 194
A11.4 Alarm acceptance..... 195
A11.5 Movement through the list..... 195
A11.6 Dealing with nuisance alarms..... 196
A11.7 Display filtering..... 196

Appendix 12 Design of field alarm sensors..... 199

A12.1 Choice of alarm sensor..... 199
A12.2 Measurement of actuator position..... 200
A12.3 Location of sensors..... 200
A12.4 Sensor range..... 201
A12.5 Validation of measurements..... 202
A12.6 Signal transmission 203
A12.7 Dependent failures 203

Appendix 13 Example alarm suppression hazard study..... 205

A13.1 Introduction 205
A13.2 Example 205
A13.2.1 Familiarisation..... 206
A13.2.2 Review of operating modes 206
A13.2.3 Review of alarms to be suppressed..... 206
A13.2.4 Reporting 207
A13.2.5 Follow-up 208

Appendix 14 Performance metrics and KPI visualisation 209

A14.1 Operator questionnaires..... 209

A14.2 Usefulness of alarms 209
A14.3 Incident recording 211
A14.4 Number of alarms 211
A14.5 Average alarm rate 211
A14.6 Identification of frequent alarms 213
A14.7 Number of alarms following a major plant upset 213
A14.8 Number of standing alarms 215
A14.9 Priority distribution 216
A14.10 Operator response time 217
A14.11 Correlation 217
A14.12 Data analysis tools 217
A14.12.1 Specification of alarm logging and analysis tools 219
A14.13 KPI improvement visualisation examples 220

Appendix 15 Specification checklist - small system 223

A15.1 Where dedicated alarm systems are used 223
A15.2 Input handling 223
A15.3 Alarm processing 223
A15.4 Alarm display/output 224
A15.5 Environmental 224

Appendix 16 Specification checklist - large system 225

A16.1 Grading of requirements 225

Appendix 17 Intelligent fault detection 231

A17.1 Pattern recognition 231
A17.2 Neural networks 232
A17.3 Fuzzy logic 233
A17.4 Knowledge-based reasoning 233
A17.5 Model-based reasoning 234
A17.6 Overview of intelligent fault detection methods 235

Appendix 18 Glossary 237

Appendix 19 References 241

Appendix 20 Bibliography 245

Figures

Figure 1 EEMUA 191 Roadmap selection xxi
Figure 2 EEMUA 191 Roadmap - Existing system xxii
Figure 3 EEMUA 191 Roadmap - Conceptual system xxiii
Figure 4 ISA 18.2 Lifecycle model xxiv
Figure 5 HCI, the sensory interface between operator and plant 2
Figure 6 Alarm system management overview 6
Figure 7 LOPA (Layer of Protection Analysis) diagram 18
Figure 8 Safety related alarm reliability requirements 21
Figure 9 Operator response stages 21
Figure 10 Proof testing of safety related alarms 23
Figure 11 An effective and ineffective alarm system 27
Figure 12 The setting of a high alarm 28
Figure 13 Operator response to an abnormal situation 33
Figure 14 The operator's role in the different plant states 36
Figure 15 Batch process conceptual model 37

Figure 16 Typical control architecture model 39
Figure 17 Typical form for loop information 47
Figure 18 Simple data input form 48
Figure 19 Typical alarm recorded information 48
Figure 20 System improvement process 53
Figure 21 Example of Alarm HCI 76
Figure 22 Alarm test methodology 86
Figure 23 Alarm suppression implementation 89
Figure 24 Steady state performance levels 103
Figure 25 Abnormal condition performance levels 103
Figure 26 Alarm system performance 104
Figure 27 Summary of alarm states 105
Figure 28 Typical plot of Key Performance Indicator 123
Figure 29 Productivity histogram 124
Figure 30 The frequency of loss incidents 124
Figure 31 Layer of protection 132
Figure 32 Alarm priority matrix 133
Figure 33 Possible priority bands to achieve required priority distribution 135
Figure 34 Prioritisation using maximum of individual priorities 137
Figure 35 General alarm assessment 140
Figure 36 Safety assessment prioritisation 141
Figure 37 Environmental assessment prioritisation 142
Figure 38 Financial (Asset) Loss Assessment Prioritisation 143
Figure 39 Repeating alarms generated by noise on a process signal 151
Figure 40 Transfer function of deadband 153
Figure 41 The elimination of repeating alarms using deadband 154
Figure 42 Alarm response - batch plant 164
Figure 43 S88 Model 165
Figure 44 Example of a separate set of alarm thresholds 166
Figure 45 Geographically distributed processes 173
Figure 46 Alarm state transition diagram for static alarm list display 192
Figure 47 Individual alarm quality quadrant 210
Figure 48 Example of alarm frequency analysis 213
Figure 49 Example plot of alarms per minute 214
Figure 50 Initial KPI improvements 221
Figure 51 Initiation of improvements in flood rate 221
Figure 52 Final improvements of all KPIs 221
Figure 53 KPI improvements shown as a radar plot 222
Figure 54 Plant system with redundant equipment 231
Figure 55 A simple neural network 233
Figure 56 A graphical rule definition 234

Tables

Table 1 Characteristics of a good alarm 4
Table 2 Activities to be considered in the design of an alarm system..... 10
Table 3 Content of a typical alarm management philosophy document..... 11
Table 4 Comparison of alarms, alerts/prompts and journal only signals..... 16
Table 5 Human reliability requirements 20
Table 6 Elements of an improvement strategy..... 51
Table 7 The objectives of an alarm system review..... 52
Table 8 Characteristics of alarm reviews for normal operation and plant upset .. 56
Table 9 Effective techniques for improving alarm systems..... 59
Table 10 Advantages and disadvantages of display options 72
Table 11 Alarm suppression..... 88
Table 12 Example of bulk alarm suppression..... 90
Table 13 Summary of possible alarm metrics per operator station..... 94
Table 14 Long term average alarm rate..... 96
Table 15 Major plant upset alarm 97
Table 16 Priority distribution..... 98
Table 17 Standing alarms..... 98
Table 18 Benchmark values for operator usability metric 98
Table 19 Summary of metrics and benchmark values 99
Table 20 Alarm system performance metrics..... 104
Table 21 Overloaded alarm state..... 108
Table 22 Reactive alarm state..... 109
Table 23 Stable alarm state..... 110
Table 24 Robust alarm state..... 111
Table 25 Alarm system hardware comparisons 114
Table 26 Elements in a user-centred operator interface design 117
Table 27 Priority distribution during system configuration 129
Table 28 Target maximum occurrence rates of alarms of different priorities.... 129
Table 29 A proposed Hazard Index grouping 133
Table 30 Priority break points for alarms 137
Table 31 Rules for allocation of safety, environmental and financial priority 138
Table 32 Table of filter time constants..... 153
Table 33 Table of default deadband settings..... 154
Table 34 Table of default de-bounce timer parameters 155
Table 35 Example of weighting of results of usefulness questionnaires..... 177
Table 36 Proportion of useful alarms..... 179
Table 37 Attributes of a good alarm message..... 193
Table 38 How system size affects design and management 212
Table 39 Benchmarks for assessing average alarm rates..... 213
Table 40 Guidance on alarm rate following an upset..... 215
Table 41 Alarm pattern array..... 232